REQUESTED CHANGE INVOLVES ISO 639-2 CODE ELEMENT

The following change request pertains to a code element included in other parts of the ISO 639 family of standards, *Codes for the representation of names of languages*. For this reason, the Registration Authority for Part 3 cannot act unilaterally in evaluating public comments and determining the outcome of the request. Public comments are nevertheless very significant to the evaluation process and will be strongly considered by the RA in making a recommendation to the ISO 639 Joint Advisory Committee regarding the action(s) to be taken in response to the requested change. The ISO 639/JAC will also be aware of all public comments submitted to the Registration Authority, and will make the final decision regarding the outcome of the request.

Change Request no. 2006-129 relates to code element [cat] Catalan. The change request proposes splitting this code element into two distinct code elements, one for a new language, Valencian, and one with a more precise designation of Catalan not including the language variety Valencian. In accordance with the management requirements of the standard, this would necessitate the retirement of the identifier [cat] and the assignment of two new identifiers to the newly designated languages. Users of the standard would then be faced with significant work to distinguish and separate the two languages in existing applications of the identifier [cat], and an ambiguous meaning of the corresponding Part 1 code element [ca] Catalan.

The Registration Authority seeks comment on the rationale for assigning a separate code element to the language variety called Valencian. Reference to the following information with regard to the criteria for determining whether two varieties represent dialects of a single language or two distinct languages within the context of the ISO 639-3 standard may assist the in evaluation:


In assessing the need for a separate code element, it is also appropriate to consider that additional levels of refinement in specification are possible through the use of the Internet Assigned Numbers Authority (IANA) Language Subtag Registry http://www.iana.org/assignments/language-subtag-registry, based on RFC 4646: http://www.rfc-archive.org/getrfc.php?rfc=4646. A language tag for Catalan of Valencia has already been assigned, ca-valencia.

If the determination is made that a new code element for Valencian is warranted, the extremely close relationship between the language varieties Catalan and Valencian still lead to the need in some contexts to identify them as a single, more broadly defined Catalan language (the current designation of the code element for Catalan). Where differing contexts call for differing degrees of distinction between language varieties, the situation is generally handled as a macrolanguage with related individual languages in the standard. In the case that a separate code element for Valencian is determined to be warranted, the recommendation of the Registration Authority for Part 3 will be that Catalan be treated as an instance of a macrolanguage, and the proposed change be amended to:

- Change scope of [ca] / [cat] from individual language to macrolanguage
- Change reference name of [ca] / [cat] to “Catalan-Valencian” or “Catalan (macrolanguage)”
- Add new code element for Valencian
- Add new code element for Catalan (individual language), excluding Valencian
ISO 639-3 Registration Authority
Request for Change to ISO 639-3 Language Code
Change Request Number: 2006-129 (completed by Registration authority)
Date: 2007-3-29
Primary Person submitting request: Joan Ignaci Serrano i Sànchez
Affiliation: Real Acadèmia de Cultura Valenciana (Royal Academy of Valencian Culture) - (RACV)

E-mail address: correu@llenguavalenciana.com
Names, affiliations and email addresses of additional supporters of this request:
Excelentíssima Diputació de València (vicent.navarro@dva.gva.es)
Ajuntament d'Almàssera / Council of Almàssera (almassera@gva.es)
Ajuntament de Silla / Council of Silla (cultura@ajuntamentdesilla.org)
Ajuntament d'Alcàsser / Council of Alcàsser (joanignacisis@yahoo.es)
Ayuntamiento de Dos Aguas / Council of Dos Aguas (robert.rodriguez@jci.com)
Lo Rat Penat (secretaria@loratpenat.org)
Federació d'Entitats Culturals del Regne de València (vrcalatayud@coacvalencia.es)
Associació d'Escritors en Llengua Valenciana (secretaria@aellva.org)
Ateneu Cultural de Paterna (repretex@villadepaterna.com)
Institut d'Estudis Valencians (marta_lanuza@wanadoo.es)
Grup Cultural Llicità (jopucvi@hotmail.com)
Rogle Constantí Llombart de Cultura Valenciana (masia_amp@gva.es)
Colectiu Cavanilles (colectiucavanilles@hotmail.com)
Taula d'Autors Teatrals (presidencia@tauladautors.com)
Editorial l'Oronella (felip@oronella.com)
Revista Lletraferit (shackleton@ono.com)
Revista Lletrafaller (juliamadeu@hotmail.com)
Associació Cultural Cardona i Vives (romero_goncas@gva.es)
Colectiu Lluís Fullana (teresapuerto@terra.es)
Grup de Dones Valencianes (kelyta79@hotmail.com)
Lo Regne en Acció (tanta@ya.com)
Associació Cultural El Piló (amartinvillalba@hotmail.com)
Plataforma Jovenil valencianista (mramon@cograsova.es)
Revers (isa5@ono.com)
Amics de la Real Acadèmia de Cultura Valenciana (secretari@amics-racv.org)
València Cultural-Via Augusta i Camí de Sant Vicent Màrtir (viaaugusta_s_vte@wanadoo.es)
Associació Cultural jovenil Mossarabia (desficium@yahoo.com)
Associació Cultural Castell dels Sorells (aatienza60@hotmail.com)
Digital Value S.L (davil@digitalvalue.es)
València Freedom (joanignaciss@hotmail.com)
Revista El Guarda (llucia@valencianisme.net)
Revista Pàtria Nova (queloscopic@yahoo.es)
Revista El Palleter (vorolopez@ono.com)
Colectiu Jovenil d’Associacions Valencianistes (jesumasia@ono.com)
Estudiants Valencianistes de la Politècnica (mybuaz@etsia.upv.es)
Colectiu Aitana (robcheva@ono.com)
Plataforma Normes d’El Puig (jferrer@valenciahui.es)
Colectiu Nacionaliste (paulalberola@hotmail.com)
Editorial Del Sénia al Segura (javigesc@hotmail.com)
València Nova (vicente.tomas.hervas@valenciamail.net)
Associació Bibliogràfica Valenciana (berarma@ya.com)

Postal address for primary contact person for this request (in general, email correspondence will be used):
correu@llenguavalenciana.com
RACV - C/ Avellanes, 26 46003 València

PLEASE NOTE: This completed form will become part of the public record of this change request and the history of the ISO 639-3 code set.
Types of change requests

This form is to be used in requesting changes (whether creation, modification, or deletion) to elements of the ISO 639 Codes for the representation of names of languages — Part 3: Alpha-3 code for comprehensive coverage of languages. The types of changes that are possible are to 1) modify the reference information for an existing code element, 2) propose a new macrolanguage or modify a macrolanguage group; 3) retire a code element from use, including merging its scope of denotation into that of another code element, 4) split an existing code element into two or more new language code elements, or 5) create a new code element for a previously unidentified language variety. Fill out section 1, 2, 3, 4, or 5 below as appropriate, and the final section documenting the sources of your information. The process by which a change is received, reviewed and adopted is summarized on the final page of this form.

Type of change proposed (check one):

1. □ Modify reference information for an existing language code element
2. □ Propose a new macrolanguage or modify a macrolanguage group
3. □ Retire a language code element from use
4. □ Split a language code element into two or more new code elements
5. □ Create a code element for a previously unidentified language

For proposing a change to an existing code element, please identify:

Affected ISO 639-3 identifier: cat
Associated reference name: catalan

1. Modify an existing language code element
   (a) What are you proposing to change:
      □ Language reference name
      □ Language additional names
      □ Language type (living, extinct, historical, etc.)
      □ Language scope (individual language or macrolanguage)
   (b) What new value(s) do you propose:
   (c) Rationale for change:

2. Propose a new macrolanguage or modify a macrolanguage group
   (a) For an existing Macrolanguage, what change to its individual language membership do you propose:
   (b) Rationale for change:

   For a new Macrolanguage proposal, please also complete the form “Request for New Language Code Element in ISO 639-3” (file name “ISO639-3_NewCodeRequest.doc” or “ISO639-3_NewCodeRequestForm.rtf”) must also be submitted to fully document the scope for the new macrolanguage.
3. Retire a language code element from use

(a) Reason for change:

- There is no evidence that the language exists.
- This is equivalent to another ISO 639-3 language.
- This is a variety that is fully intelligible with another ISO 639-3 language and should be merged with it.

(b) If one of the latter two reasons, with which ISO 639-3 code element (identifier and name) should it be merged:

(c) Rationale for change:

4. Split a language code element into two or more code elements

(a) List the languages into which this code element should be split:

catalan ; valencian

By the language identification criteria set forth in ISO 639-3, the simple fact of distinct identities is not enough to assign separate identifiers. The criteria are defined in the standard as follows:

For this part of ISO 639, judgments regarding when two varieties are considered to be the same or different languages are based on a number of factors, including linguistic similarity, intelligibility, a common literature (traditional or written), a common writing system, the views of users concerning the relationship between language and identity, and other factors. The following basic criteria are followed:

- Two related varieties are normally considered varieties of the same language if users of each variety have inherent understanding of the other variety (that is, can understand based on knowledge of their own variety without needing to learn the other variety) at a functional level.
- Where intelligibility between varieties is marginal, the existence of a common literature or of a common ethnolinguistic identity with a central variety that both understand can be strong indicators that they should nevertheless be considered varieties of the same language.
- Where there is enough intelligibility between varieties to enable communication, the existence of well-established distinct ethnolinguistic identities can be a strong indicator that they should nevertheless be considered to be different languages.

(b) Referring to the criteria given above, give the rationale for splitting the existing code element into two or more languages:

The valencian and the catalan are two different languages, each one is official in his territory, the Valencian language it is only in Valencia, and the catalan language it is in Catalonia, but not in Valencia. This way the respective Bylaws of Autonomy reflect it clearly. In the Valencian case:

“Estatut d’Autonomia de la Comunitat Valenciana de 1982” states in the article 7 that “the two officially recognized languages in “Comunitat Valenciana” are Valencian and Spanish language” (art. 7.1) giving “special protection and respect to the recovering of Valencian language”.

Request for Change to ISO 639-3 Language Code, page 4
Likewise, in the Valencian Statute of autonomy reform, passed on 2006, it is recognized in the article 6 that “the belonging language of “Comunitat Valenciana” is valencian language” (art. 6.1) and that “valencian language is the official language of “Comunitat Valenciana” and also the Spanish language that is the official language of the State” (art. 6.2).

It's clear, that alone speaks itself of valencian language, and does not mention ever the catalan language. Equal it happens in the Statute of Autonomy of Catalonia, where one does not refer to the valencian language.

In addition, like it is an official language of Valencia, also it is from Spain, and this way it is reflected in the Spanish Constitution:

The “Constitución Española” (Spanish Constitution) of 1978, states in the article 3.2 that, besides Spanish “the other Spanish languages will also be officially recognized in their belonging communities following their statutes of autonomy”, due to the fact that they are cultural heritage and they should be respected and protected.

The valencian language and the catalan language have normative different systems, different spelling, different syntax, different lexicon and different phonetics. Because of it, the Valencian language possesses her own grammar and her own dictionary. And the Catalan language her own grammar and her own dictionary. For all that, the intelligibility is scanty.

Because of it we need an ISO own code. Without this code, conflicts appear since it is not allowed that the translations to the Valencian language use the code CAT, for not being a Catalan language. And the producers of software have problems to accept a translation if the Valencian language does not have an ISO code. This limits the development of a minority language like it is the Valencian language. Equally, there exist a great number of web pages written in Valencian language, which do not use ningun code of language for not having ISO own code.

In conclusion, on having had two normative different systems, for treating itself about two different languages, it is indispensable to have an ISO own code, to be able to develop all the projects that at present companies and other entities including the Valencian Administration they have paralyzed.

(c) Does the language code element to be split represent a major language in which there already exists a significant body of literature and research? Are there contexts in which all the proposed separate languages may still be considered the same language—as in having a common linguistic identity, a shared (or undistinguished) body of literature, a written form in common, etc.? If so, please comment.

Since Valencian lands were incorporated to western world after the conquest of Jaume I the King, Valencian language has been the Public Administration official language. Legally, socially and historically, Valencian language is and has been recognized by Valencian people as one of the most important identity signs within its rich idiosyncrasy.

The first written documents we found in Valencian language are the ones known as harches; these are poems written in Arabic language from which their last verses were written in Valencian language. These texts were written before the entrance of Jaume I the King to Valencian City in the year 1238. The harches existence, amongst other aspects, justifies the presence of an autochthon language (romance) before the Christian conquest of Jaume I the King. Some of these harches are “ Ibn al-Labbana de Dénia” or “Abu Isa ibn Labbun” both form XII century.
It is worth mentioning the creation of a valencian version of the Bible by Saint Pere Pasqual:
La Bíblia Parva. After the harches production, other juridical documents and other
documents related to other matters, this work is considered by most intellectuals as the
origin of the valencian literary tradition. Furthermore, in the same century the trials were in
the people’s language: valencian language in order that everyone could understand them –
This is recorded like that in the Furs—

The XIV is remarkable for the works or Antoni Canals and the sermons of Saint Vicent Ferrer.
Canals wrote religious works as l’Escala de contemplació, book of spiritual exercises, and
translator to Valencian language of works from Valeri Màxim, Sèneça and Petrarca. The
sermons of Saint Vicent Ferrer tried to indoctrinate in catholic theory the common people
who had not general or religious culture; this is one of most important expressions of
Valencian literature from any time.

Afterwards, along the “Segle D’Or” (golden century) of Valencian Arts ( XV century), Valencian
language was the indisputable vehicle of culture and literature of that time; this displaced
the Latin language usage which was consider in that time the science and international
culture language. Valencia, European cultural capital of that time, offers authors with
international prestige that recognize to write in Valencian language.

Poetry is based in the works of Ausias March, knight and poet clearly differentiated from others
troubadours of that time for his usage of Valencian language in its works. It is also
remarkable the work of Joanot Martorell in its novel Tirant lo Blanch, as he appoints, it is
written in Valencian language or “vulgar valenciana: per ço que la nació d’on yo sò natural
se’n puxa alegrar”. Other important authors are sor Isabel de Villena, Jordi de Sant Jordi,
Joan Roïç de Corella, Bernat Fenollar or Jaume Gasull.

From XVI century onwards, especially after the war of “Germanies” in 1521, there will be
spread the usage of Spanish language in nobility and bourgeoisie social sectors, this
means a major use of Spanish language for the valencian intellectuals of that time. A
“Decadence” period started in that moment. It did not mean the total oral or written
extinction of the language but a change in language consideration by the intellectuals, in
favour of Spanish language and in detriment of Valencian language, replacing it in different
fields. Notwithstanding, popular literature production continued on Valencian language.

This trend was increased after the “Successió” War: Carles II dead without issue, Felip V and
the archduke Carles wrestled for the throne coming, being his first victory in Almansa in
1707. Felip V took reprisals against the Valencian people for having supported the
archduke and revoked the “Furs” and privileges of Valecian Reign, he burnt cities as Xàtiva
where the resistance had been higher, and he officially imposed Spanish language.

In XIX century there was a language and culture recuperation movement thanks to the
intentions of a group of intellectuals worried for their roots and identity recovering. This
movement was called “Renaixença”, encouraged by Constantí Lombart and followed by
other authors as Teodor Llorente. Llombart , from progressive and republican tendency
leaded a poets group called “l'Espardenya”, in favour of a language close to the people, not
artificial. On the other hand, Llorente from a strong conservative tendency leaded the poets group called “de Guant” followers of an archaic and pompous language model.

In this historical period as created the “Sociedat d'Amadors de les Glòries Valencianes: Lo Rat Penat (1878)”. Since their beginning this society was aimed to the intellectual union, goal oriented to the Valencian language culture and language promotion and spreading. In this period the “Jocs Florals de la Ciutat i Regne de València” was created, nowadays is one of the most ancient and prestigious literary competition.

From a philological point of view, there are not enough basis and arguments to restrain the consideration of Valencian as a language. As regards John Lyons' theory –author of different works related to modern linguistics and teacher of this matter in universities like Edinburgh, Sussex or Cambrige- “differences between languages and dialects are closely related among between them, are mostly political, cultural and something else than linguistics” We can find it in his work Introduction to theoretical linguistics published by Cambridge University in 1971.

The linguistic consciousness of the majority of the people of “Comunitat Valenciana” recognize his autochthon language, the language they speak under the name of Valencian language, an independent and language from any other romance language – following the results from the surveys of “Centre d’Investigacions Sociològiques”-. It is accepted the belonging of Valencian language to the west romance diasystem, but the fact that a language belongs to a diasystem does not mean the denial of this language independence.

On the other hand, Valencian lexicographic tradition supports Valencian linguistic identity. Practically speaking, it has no sense to insist in the dictionaries, grammars, treaties, and similar works publication if its existence is not admitted. It is worth mentioning that Valencian language pioneered the romance lexicography.

Valencian notary Joan Esteve created his first Valencian dictionary in 1472, published after 26 years in Venice; it is known as “Líber Elegantiarum”. In 1764 Valencian notary Carles Ros published “Valencian- Spanish Language Dictionary”, developing the entries of “Breu Diccionari Valencià-Castellà” of 1739. It would be along the before mentioned “Renaixença” when it was increased the interest in valencian lexicography, the works of Josep Escrig, Constantí Llombart and Martí Gadea are highly remarkable.

In XX century, it should be highlighted the importance of the work the philologist Lluís Fullana who published in 1921 “Vocabulari Ortogràfic Valencià-Castellà” with more than 45.000 entries. Another very important and remarkable lexicographic work is the one made in “Real Academia de Cultura Valenciana”, now (2006) the forth edition from its “Diccionari Ortogràfic Valencià-Castellà / Castellà-Valencià” is being prepared, also it is just about to finish the edition of Diccionari General de la Llengua Valenciana, in two volumes (foreseen for 2007) and in addition to all this, a spelling mistakes corrector for informatics resources is also being made.
Linguistic consciousness from valencian intellectuals along history is very clear, practically since the first valencian literary works, all the different authors has always stated and assumed that their works were written in Valencian language, it can be checked in the following historical summary:

Antoni Canals in 1395: [...] tret del llatí en nostra vulgar lenga materna valenciana [...]

Bonifaci Ferrer in the colophon of Bíblia Valenciana in 1478: Acaba la Biblia molt vera e catholica, treta de una biblia del noble mossen Berenguer Vives de Boïl, cavaller, la qual fon trelladada de aquella propia que fon arromançada en lo monestir de Portacoeli, de llengua latina en la nostra valenciana [...]

Joanot Martorell in the dedicatory he wrote in 1490 in its well known novel Tirant Lo Blanch (the most important work of valencian literature from all the times): [...] me atreviré a expondre: no solament de lengua anglesa en portuguesa. Mas encara de portuguesa en vulgar valenciana: per ço que la nació d'on yo só natural se’n puxa alegrar [...]

Joan Esteve in the dictionary Líber Elegantiarum publicat in Venice in 1498: [...] in latina et valenciana lingua exactissima diligentia emendatus.

Joan Bonlabi in Blanquerna (original from Ramon Llull), year 1521: [...] Traduit: y corregit ara novelment dels primers originals y estampat en llengua valenciana [...]

Marc Antoni Ortí, Poetry of 1667, quoted by S. Faus i Sabater (in 1973): [...] Que sía la lengua valenciana millor que totes de Europa en apres de la lengua sancta

Joan Carles Amat in Tractat breu, i explicació dels punts de la guitarra en Idioma Valencià , year 1740: En Idioma Valencià [...] per a què'ts naturals, que gustaren de dependre, y no entengueren la explicació Castellana, puguen satisfier son gust en este breu y compendiós estil.

Marc Antoni Orellana in “Catàlec i descripció dels pardals de l’Albufera de València” published in 1795: [...] no falten forasters que desigen saber la llengua valenciana [...]

Civera Manuel in Desena i última conversació de Sao Negre i el Dotor Cudol , in 1820: [...] Molt despreciada està la llengua valenciana, i és la causa, perque els mateixos que debien ensalsarla la degraden. [...] 

Francesc Carreres i Candi in Geografia General del Regne de València, year 1920: La alta administració de Justicia [...] actuaba en valenciano, y en este idioma se imprimieron las leyes forales, aún en pleno siglo XVI [...]

C. Salvador in l’idioma Valencià. Experiment (pàg. 89), in 1923: L’idioma valencià es l’únic adequat per a l’ensenyança dels valencians [...]

Request for Change to ISO 639-3 Language Code, page 8
Conclusión:

We, the Valencian Language and Literature Department from “Real Acadèmia de Cultura Valenciana” state that Valencian language is the language belonging to the old “Regne de València”, nowadays “Comunitat Valenciana” following the historical, philological and sociological reality. This is recognized like that in the actual juridical order, stated and protected by article 7 of “l’Estatut d’Autonomia de la Comunitat Valenciana” and its reform of 2006, where it is regulated without any doubt as “Idioma Valencià”. “L’Estatut d’Autonomia de la Comunitat Valenciana”, is a norm of constitucionallity. Supported by “l’Estatut” and articles 3 and 9 from Spanish Constitution that protects autochthon languages to be officially recognized as well as legality and juridical security principles.

In order to complete the change request, the form “Request for New Language Code Element in ISO 639-3” (file name “ISO639-3_NewCodeRequestForm.doc” or “ISO639-3_NewCodeRequestForm.rtf”) must also be submitted for each new identifier that is to be created. That step can be deferred until this form has been processed by the ISO 639-3 registrar.

5. Create a new language code element

(a) Name of missing language:

(b) State the case that this language is not the same as or has not been included within any language that already has an identifier in ISO 639-3:

In order to complete the change request, the form “Request for New Language Code Element in ISO 639-3” (file name “ISO639-3_NewCodeRequest.doc” or “ISO639-3_NewCodeRequestForm.rtf”) must also be submitted to more fully document the new language.

Sources of information

Please use whichever of the points below are relevant in order to document the sources on which you have based the above proposal.

(a) First-hand knowledge. Describe:

(b) Knowledge through personal communication. Describe:

(c) Knowledge from published sources (please give complete bibliographical references):
The change proposal process

A request to change the code set goes through a six-step process:

1. A user of ISO 639-3 proposes a change and submits it to the ISO 639-3 Registration Authority (ISO 639-3/RA) using this form.

2. The ISO 639-3 registrar processes the change request to verify that the request is compatible with the criteria set forth in the standard and to ensure that the submitter has supplied all necessary information. This may involve rounds of interaction with the submitter.

3. When the change request proposal is complete in its documentation (including all associated New Code Requests), the change request is promoted to “Proposed Change” status and the ISO 639-3 registrar posts the request on the official web site of the ISO 639-3/RA. Also at this time, an announcement is sent to anyone requesting notification of new proposals matching their specified criteria (region and/or language family of interest). Periodically, a message maybe sent to the general LINGUIST discussion list on Linguist List (http://linguistlist.org/issues/index.html), and other appropriate discussion lists, inviting individuals to review and comment on pending proposals. Anyone may request from the ISO 639-3 registrar to receive notification regarding proposals involving languages in a specific region of the world or specific language family.

4. Individuals may send comments to the ISO 639-3 registrar for compilation. The consensus of early reviews may result in promotion to “Candidate Status” (with or without amendment), or withdrawal of the change request, if the conclusion is that the request is not in keeping with the stated criteria of the ISO 639-3 standard.

5. Three months prior to the end of the annual cycle of review and update (ordinarily October 1st), a new notice is posted on the official web site of the ISO 639-3/RA, and an announcement listing the Candidate Status Change Requests is posted to the LINGUIST discussion list and other discussion lists, as requested by their owners. All change requests are then open to further review and comment by any interested party for a period of three months. A Change Request received after the start of Candidacy phase must wait until the next annual cycle for consideration. The purpose of this phase is to ensure that a minimum of three months is allotted for the review of every proposal.

6. At the end of the formal review period, a given Change Request may be: 1) adopted as a whole; 2) adopted in part (specific changes implicit in the whole Change Request may be adopted separately); 3) amended and resubmitted for the next review cycle; or 4) withdrawn from consideration. All change requests remain permanently archived at the official web site of the ISO 639-3/RA.

Please return this form to:
ISO 639-3 Registrar
SIL International, Office of Language Information Systems
7500 West Camp Wisdom Road
Dallas, Texas 75236 USA
E-mail: iso639-3@sil.org

An email attachment of this completed form is preferred.

Sources of documentation for ISO 639-3 identifiers: