ISO 639-3 Registration Authority

Request for Change to ISO 639-3 Language Code

Change Request Number: 2007-132 (completed by Registration authority)

Date: 2007-8-22

Primary Person submitting request: Conrad Hurd

Affiliation: SIL International

E-mail address: editor_ethnologue@sil.org

Names, affiliations and email addresses of additional supporters of this request:

Postal address for primary contact person for this request (in general, email correspondence will be used):
Ethnologue Editor, 7500 W Camp Wisdom Rd., Dallas, TX, 75236

PLEASE NOTE: This completed form will become part of the public record of this change request and the history of the ISO 639-3 code set.

Types of change requests

This form is to be used in requesting changes (whether creation, modification, or deletion) to elements of the ISO 639 Codes for the representation of names of languages — Part 3: Alpha-3 code for comprehensive coverage of languages. The types of changes that are possible are to 1) modify the reference information for an existing code element, 2) propose a new macrolanguage or modify a macrolanguage group; 3) retire a code element from use, including merging its scope of denotation into that of another code element, 4) split an existing code element into two or more new language code elements, or 5) create a new code element for a previously unidentified language variety. Fill out section 1, 2, 3, 4, or 5 below as appropriate, and the final section documenting the sources of your information. The process by which a change is received, reviewed and adopted is summarized on the final page of this form.

Type of change proposed (check one):

1. ☒ Modify reference information for an existing language code element
2. ☐ Propose a new macrolanguage or modify a macrolanguage group
3. ☐ Retire a language code element from use
4. ☐ Split a language code element into two or more new code elements
5. ☐ Create a code element for a previously unidentified language

For proposing a change to an existing code element, please identify:

Affected ISO 639-3 identifier: [hmz]

Associated reference name: Hmong Shua

1. Modify an existing language code element
   (a) What are you proposing to change:
      ☐ Language reference name
      ☒ Language additional names
(b) What new value(s) do you propose: *Add Sinicized Miao as additional name*

(c) Rationale for change:

This language is spoken by populations in both Vietnam and China, though the 15th edition of the Ethnologue only lists it as existing within Vietnam.

"Sinicized Miao" is a translation to English of their autonym, “Hmong Sad,” which means “Chinese Hmong” or “Sinicized Hmong,” but preserving consistency with the principle of listing most of these Hmongic languages under “Miao.” With reference to this language as spoken in China, it is better not to directly use the autonym, Hmong Sa, because their own pronunciation conflicts with the official standard spelling, Hmong Shua. Hmong Shua is also not a good choice for the context of China because this official spelling and pronunciation would not be recognized by the people themselves.

Why not use the term “Hmong”? The term “Miao” is not derogatory in China as the terms “Miao” or “Meo” sometimes are in southeast Asia. Furthermore, over-use in English of the term “Hmong” is not appropriate in a Chinese context, as it may be interpreted as failing to contribute to the nation’s efforts to unify the various Miao subgroups and to encourage the various ethnic groups to live in harmony.

2. Propose a new macrolanguage or modify a macrolanguage group

(a) For an existing Macrolanguage, what change to its individual language membership do you propose:

(b) Rationale for change:

For a new Macrolanguage proposal, please also complete the form “Request for New Language Code Element in ISO 639-3” (file name “ISO639-3_NewCodeRequest.doc” or “ISO639-3_NewCodeRequestForm.rtf”) must also be submitted to fully document the scope for the new macrolanguage.

3. Retire a language code element from use

(a) Reason for change:

- [ ] There is no evidence that the language exists.
- [ ] This is equivalent to another ISO 639-3 language.
- [ ] This is a variety that is fully intelligible with another ISO 639-3 language and should be merged with it.

(b) If one of the latter two reasons, with which ISO 639-3 code element (identifier and name) should it be merged:

(c) Rationale for change:
4. Split a language code element into two or more code elements

(a) List the languages into which this code element should be split:

By the language identification criteria set forth in ISO 639-3, the simple fact of distinct identities is not enough to assign separate identifiers. The criteria are defined in the standard as follows:

For this part of ISO 639, judgments regarding when two varieties are considered to be the same or different languages are based on a number of factors, including linguistic similarity, intelligibility, a common literature (traditional or written), a common writing system, the views of users concerning the relationship between language and identity, and other factors. The following basic criteria are followed:

- Two related varieties are normally considered varieties of the same language if users of each variety have inherent understanding of the other variety (that is, can understand based on knowledge of their own variety without needing to learn the other variety) at a functional level.
- Where intelligibility between varieties is marginal, the existence of a common literature or of a common ethnolinguistic identity with a central variety that both understand can be strong indicators that they should nevertheless be considered varieties of the same language.
- Where there is enough intelligibility between varieties to enable communication, the existence of well-established distinct ethnolinguistic identities can be a strong indicator that they should nevertheless be considered to be different languages.

(b) Referring to the criteria given above, give the rationale for splitting the existing code element into two or more languages:

(c) Does the language code element to be split represent a major language in which there already exists a significant body of literature and research? Are there contexts in which all the proposed separate languages may still be considered the same language—as in having a common linguistic identity, a shared (or undistinguished) body of literature, a written form in common, etc.? If so, please comment.

In order to complete the change request, the form “Request for New Language Code Element in ISO 639-3” (file name “ISO639-3_NewCodeRequestForm.doc” or “ISO639-3_NewCodeRequestForm.rtf”) must also be submitted for each new identifier that is to be created. That step can be deferred until this form has been processed by the ISO 639-3 registrar.

5. Create a new language code element

(a) Name of missing language:

(b) State the case that this language is not the same as or has not been included within any language that already has an identifier in ISO 639-3:
In order to complete the change request, the form “Request for New Language Code Element in ISO 639-3” (file name “ISO639-3_NewCodeRequest.doc” or “ISO639-3_NewCodeRequestForm.rtf”) must also be submitted to more fully document the new language.

Sources of information

Please use whichever of the points below are relevant in order to document the sources on which you have based the above proposal.

(a) First-hand knowledge. Describe:

(b) Knowledge through personal communication. Describe:

A colleague has observed Sinicized Miao speakers who were unable to understand clear audio recordings of folktales in the Chuanqiandian Cluster Miao lect; they were able to catch a few words here and there but not the main story line. They also reported to this colleague that they are unable to use the Miao language to communicate with speakers of other Miao varieties, whether Chuanqiandian Cluster Miao lects, Large Flowery Miao, Small Flowery Miao or overseas Hmong speaking Hmong Daw or Hmong Njua.

A Chinese Miao scholar in personal communication reported that speakers of Sinicized Miao are able to use the mother tongue to carry on conversations with speakers of Chuanqiandian Cluster Miao. (24 August 2007).

(c) Knowledge from published sources (please give complete bibliographical references):

Hattaway states that Hmong Shuad (Sinicized Miao) is a separate variety from other Miao lects and quite divergent from them, as well as being a distinct ethnolinguistic group.


Xian Songkui, in speaking of branches of the Miao nationality in the Zhijin area of western Guizhou, including Sinicized Miao, writes: 不同的支系不但表现在语言、服饰及头饰方面的不同，而且不同的支系还不互相通婚。我们承认苗族内部有不同的支系，这并不影响苗族内部的团结，“正如一个家庭共分为几支或几房一样。”(Xian Songkui. 织金苗语方言记略 [Zhijin Miaoyu Fangyan Jilue] in Guizhou Minzu Diaocha, Guizhou Sheng Minzu Yanjiusuo, p. 749) [Rough translation to English: Different branches of the Miao not only exhibit different languages, clothing styles and head ornamentation styles, but they also do not intermarry. We acknowledge that there are different branches among the Miao, but this does not at all affect the unity among them, "just as one family may be found in several branches or several houses.”]


The change proposal process

A request to change the code set goes through a six-step process:

1. A user of ISO 639-3 proposes a change and submits it to the ISO 639-3 Registration Authority (ISO 639-3/RA) using this form.

2. The ISO 639-3 registrar processes the change request to verify that the request is compatible with the criteria set forth in the standard and to ensure that the submitter has supplied all necessary information. This may involve rounds of interaction with the submitter.

3. When the change request proposal is complete in its documentation (including all associated New Code Requests), the change request is promoted to “Proposed Change” status and the ISO 639-3 registrar posts the request on the official web site of the ISO 639-3/RA. Also at this time, an announcement is sent to anyone requesting notification of new proposals matching their specified criteria (region and/or language family of interest). Periodically, a message maybe sent to the general LINGUIST discussion list on Linguist List (http://linguistlist.org/issues/index.html), and other appropriate discussion lists, inviting individuals to review and comment on pending proposals. Anyone may request from the ISO 639-3 registrar to receive notification regarding proposals involving languages in a specific region of the world or specific language family.

4. Individuals may send comments to the ISO 639-3 registrar for compilation. The consensus of early reviews may result in promotion to “Candidate Status” (with or without amendment), or withdrawal of the change request, if the conclusion is that the request is not in keeping with the stated criteria of the ISO 639-3 standard.

5. Three months prior to the end of the annual cycle of review and update (ordinarily October 1st), a new notice is posted on the official web site of the ISO 639-3/RA, and an announcement listing the Candidate Status Change Requests is posted to the LINGUIST discussion list and other discussion lists, as requested by their owners. All change requests are then open to further review and comment by any interested party for a period of three months. A Change Request received after the start of Candidacy phase must wait until the next annual cycle for consideration. The purpose of this phase is to ensure that a minimum of three months is allotted for the review of every proposal.

6. At the end of the formal review period, a given Change Request may be: 1) adopted as a whole; 2) adopted in part (specific changes implicit in the whole Change Request may be adopted separately); 3) amended and resubmitted for the next review cycle; or 4) withdrawn from consideration. All change requests remain permanently archived at the official web site of the ISO 639-3/RA.

Please return this form to:
ISO 639-3 Registrar
SIL International, Office of Language Information Systems
7500 West Camp Wisdom Road
Dallas, Texas 75236 USA

Request for Change to ISO 639-3 Language Code, page 5
E-mail: iso639-3@sil.org

An email attachment of this completed form is preferred.

**Sources of documentation for ISO 639-3 identifiers:**